

A COMPARISON OF HINDU AND BUDDHIST
TECHNIQUES OF ATTAINING SAMĀDH

Eddie Crangle

Yogaś cittavṛtti-nirodyaḥ

'*Yoga is the cessation of mind-movement.*'

Thus wrote Patañjali at the beginning of his *Yoga-sūtra*, relating to his technique of attaining final emancipation (mokṣa). Both Yogic and Buddhist schools of thought share fundamental presuppositions about *yoga*. Included, among others, are: a.) the equation; existence equals suffering, and b.) the doctrine of the possibility of obtaining transcendental knowledge (jñāna, prajñā). In addition, both schools stress a form of self-discipline for obtaining release. The growing preoccupation of contemporary western studies in religion and the therapies etc., with the nature of consciousness, the essential characteristics of human suffering, and the freedom from such, leads invariably to the examination and theoretical consideration of the individual's efforts to master consciousness.

Our editors, in the Introduction, understand such expertise to encompass'... a greater capacity to deploy various forms of attention in a host of ways towards any particular objects, thoughts, and feelings which make up the whole of our sensory environments.' Yogic practices, however, aim also to reduce those aspects of the consciousness flow which are viewed as hindrances to attaining the '... ideal of perceptual and cognitive freedom', i.e., the final emancipation of highest samādhi. It is my intention, in this essay, to compare Hindu and Buddhist techniques of achieving samādhi and thus to contribute, hopefully, a little to the clarification of some consciousness studies in Eastern traditions of philosophy, psychology, and religion.

In particular, I will examine the method relating to the samādhi of Patañjali's *Yoga-sūtra* and to that of

the Buddhist P.Rūpa and Arūpa Jhānas*. In these cases, technique refers to the gradual removal of hindrances, to the refinement of consciousness, until the psychic flux is arrested and the experience of complete fusion of the subject and object of meditation ensues: then, '... the true nature of the object shines forth not distracted by the mind of the perceiver ...'²

In Patañjali's system of yoga there are eight steps (astāṅga) or stages: two, namely moral restraints (yama) and disciplines of the body and psyche (niyama), are considered to be necessary preliminaries to the remainder: three are necessary to mind control by governing the disciplining of body (asana), vital force (prāṇayāma) and senses (pratyāhāra) and the final three stages are the process by which the experience of unification occurs. These are concentration (dhāraṇā), meditation (dhyāna) and enstasy, (samādhi), described as stasis and conjunction.³ These three steps are known as 'samyama'. The eighth stage, enstasy, is the final phase of the unification process.

Dhāraṇā is '... holding the mind in a motionless state...' by fixing it to some mental or external object by repeated effort. Eventually, an even current of thought (dhyāna), undisturbed by other thoughts, is directed towards the object, thus allowing the yogin '... to intercept the flux of ordinary mental activity,' (citta-vṛtti)⁴ which gradually diminishes as the absorption deepens. The result is samādhi.

When samādhi is obtained with the aid of an object of concentration, this is called 'samprajñāta-samādhi'; the lower form of samādhi which is 'the accurate knowing of distinguishables'.⁵ In samprajñāti-samādhi are eight ontological levels of the contemplated object and degrees of fusion attained. Each level has its own mode of function or logic. It may be that the states are not discrete but are differences discerned on a continuum. These are: a. vitarka, b. vicāra, c. ananda and d. asmitā, each of which have two forms: 'sa' forms and 'nir' forms. 'Sa' forms are 'propertied' when the object of meditation is associated with deliberation and reflection: the mind names the object (śabda), gives it significance (artha) and '... properties by comparison with some other thing (smṛti) on the basis of remembered past experience.'⁶ They have

* Sanskrit has been used throughout except in cases where the Pāli seemed appropriate. These are marked with the letter 'P.'

a sense of 'I'.

'Nir' forms are those without deliberation and reflection: the mind does not interfere and so there is no 'I' sense.

Both types are 'seeded' (sabija); that is, they are '... in relation with a 'substratum' (support) and produce tendencies that are like 'seeds' for the future functions of consciousness.'

Sa-vitarka samādhi, then, is enstasy when the mind has a gross (sthūla) aspect of the object of concentration as its base, while being accompanied by deliberation and reflection. It is a direct perception of the object that extends into the past and future. Nir-vitarka samādhi is the moment when the object is empty of name and meaning: when the mind ceases linking verbal and logical associations with it and the object is'... grasped directly... as a concrete and irreducible datum.'⁸

Sa-vicāra samādhi is the level of knowing the subtle (sūkṣma) or inner aspect of the object of concentration accompanied with deliberation and reflection. However, in nir-vicāra samādhi, when absorption deepens and supramental reflection ceases'... thought then becomes one with these infinitesimal nucleuses of energy which constitute the true foundation of the physical universe.'⁹

At this same point of enstasy are found two other forms of contemplation; Ananda-samādhi, associated with supreme joy - unspeakable bliss. This becomes the object of concentration, and all perception, including that of the subtle aspect, is abandoned. This leads to asmita samādhi: the stage at which the self becomes the sole object of reflection and'... the yogi reaches his true self and understands 'I am (asmi) other than my body'.¹⁰

This level of knowing is also called 'dharma-megha-samādhi': the 'cloud of dharma' in which the yogin '... feels that he is saturated (with virtues) and... has a feeling of 'Enough' in respect to all knowledge and all consciousness...' and so precipitates the subject orientated ecstasy - asamprajñāta-samādhi.¹¹

Asamprajñāta samādhi, procured by supreme detachment or abandonment (para-vairāgya) of all worldly ob-

jects, still remains seeded with subconscious impressions (samskāras) but these are burnt up with repeated practise¹² until the yogin attains the nirbijā (without seed) state of Kaivalya - '... the enstasy of total emptiness, without sensory content or intellectual structure.. in which the yogin is actually all Being.'¹³ Emancipation!

The saṁādhi of Buddhism is considered to be similar to that of the Yoga-sūtra¹⁴ and the meditational techniques bear some similarity, as I hope to show. In this instance, I will examine, mainly, the different Buddhist Raptures (P.jhāna) in relation to saṁprājñata and asamprājñata samādhi.

The Noble Eight-fold Path of the Buddha, like Patañjali's astāṅga-yoga, is concerned also with moral, bodily, and mental discipline. The last three members of the Path are directly related to the unification process. These are: a. 'right exertion' (P.samma-vāyama), which, by controlling the emotive reactions to external activity, wards off unwholesome mental activity; b. 'right mindfulness' (P.samma-sati), which is the cultivation of awareness in order to keep the mental contents under constant control and to produce relaxation of body and mind. This is done by choosing a certain body function, such as breathing, and following it with the mind, and c. the development of 'right unification' (P.samma-saṁādhi) which comprises of eight meditative phases named P.jhāna'.

These phases of consciousness are progressively refined until all false ideas of life, matter and the hindrance of thought are dispersed. Like the levels of saṁādhi in the Yoga-Sūtra, these are divided into two main types: the P.Rūpa Jhānas which are attained by concentration and meditation on a mental or external form and b. the P.Arūpa Jhanas: the 'formless attainments.'

The four P.Rūpa Jhānas, the practise of mind-object contemplation, possess five psychological elements which are reduced as the concentration of mind intensifies. These are: 1. investigation (vitarka, P.vitakka), 2. reasoning (vicāra), 3. zest (P.pīti), 4. happiness (P.pīti-sukha) and 5. one-pointedness of mind (P.ekaggatācitta).¹⁵

The first P.jhāna is the state of mind in which the meditation is disassociated from sense desires and the

five psychological factors, previously mentioned, arise in him. The object of reflection is taken up and considered at length.¹⁶ This seems, to me, to be similar to the 'sa' forms of saṁprajñāti samādhi in which the object of concentration, in its gross and subtle aspects, is considered in similar light.

However, as concentration and bliss intensifies, the second P.jhāna is entered and the obstacles of applied and discursive thinking are dispensed with.¹⁷ The 'nir' forms of nir-vitarka and nir-vicāra samādhi bear a resemblance to this state in the sense that the gross and subtle aspects of that meditation are experienced without reflection.

When the third P.jhāna is entered, zest is dispensed with, leaving happiness and one pointedness of mind. In this state '... the sense of self is still further diminished... there supervenes a clear, unruffled, perfectly conscious bliss...' Ananda saṁādhi resembles this experience because of supreme joy being its object of concentration. However, the tranquil, all satisfying happiness (P.pīti) of the third P.jhāna gives way to the subtle joy of tranquil mindfulness¹⁸ which probably bears a greater resemblance to the transition towards asmita samādhi.

The last stage of the P.Rūpa Jhānas is reached when any kind of emotion is stopped and all that remains of the five psychological factors is one-pointedness of mind; consciousness of opposites is transcended creating perfect equanimity²⁰ and consciousness passes beyond to the first of the P.Arūpa Jhanas; the formless attainments. I am reminded, here, of the renunciation of dharma-megha-saṁādhi and the entry to the subject orientated ecstasy of asamprajñata saṁādhi by supreme detachment and abandonment of all worldly objects.

It is at this point of the essay that I would like to draw attention, again, to seeded consciousness and consciousness without seed. When it is seeded, consciousness is affected by suppressed ideas and feelings which remain as tendencies within the mind: these tendencies lose their power to germinate in the higher realms of consciousness.²¹

I feel that the P.Arūpa Jhānas resemble the sabija-asamprajñata-saṁādhi, which is seeded, at least, due to the inclination to sustain this saṁādhi. The formless attainments are seeded to the degree that they owe their

HINDU

SAMPRAJNĀTA - Subject-Object Orientated.
'seeded'

SA VITARKA SAMĀDHĀ
'With Deliberation & Reflection'.
'Gross Object of concentration is 'Propertyed'

SA VICĀRA SAMĀDH
'With Deliberation & Reflection'
'Inner' Aspect of Object of Concentration is
'Propertied'.

SA ĀNANDA SAMĀDHI
"With Deliberation & Reflection"
Bliss as Object of concentration is 'Propertied'

SA ASMITA SAMĀDH
'With Deliberation & Relection'
Self as Object of Concentration is 'Propertied'

NIR VITARKA SAMĀDHI
NOT 'With Deliberation & Relection'
Gross object of concentration is NOT 'Propertied'

NIR VICĀRA SAMĀDHĪ
NOT 'With Deliberation & Reflection'
'Inner' Aspect of Object of Concentration is NOT
'Propertied'

NIR ĀNANDA SAMĀDHĀ
Bliss as Object of Concentration
NOT 'Propertied'

NIR ASMITA SAMĀDHĀ 'Self' as Object of Concentration NOT 'Propertied'

DHARMA-MEGHA-SAMĀDHĀ
ASAMPRAJÑĀTA - Subject Oriented 'seeded'
Burning up subconsciousness impressions

KAIVALYA - Without Seed.

BUDDHIST

4 RŪPA JHĀNAS (P.) - Subject-Object Orientated. 'seeded'

1st JHĀNA (P.) - 5 Psychological Factors Present

1. Investigation/Application of Thought (VITARKA,P.VITAKKA)
2. Reasoning/Discursive Thought (VICĀRA)
3. Zest
4. Happiness
5. One-Pointedness of Mind.

2nd JHĀNA (P.) - 3 Psychological Factors Present

1. Zest
 2. Happiness
 3. One-Pointedness of Mind

Feeling of Bliss Intensified

3rd JHĀNA (P.) - 2 Psychological Factors Present

1. Happiness
 2. One-Pointedness of Mind

4th JHĀNA (P.) - 1 Psychological Factor Present

- ## 1. One-Pointedness of Mind

4 ARŪPA JHĀNAS (P.) - Subject Orientated

Ist Formless Attainment "Seeded"

2nd " " "

3rd " " "

4th " " Limit of Karmic Action
 NIRVĀNA Without Good P. NIRBĀNA

NIRVANA - Without Seed P.NIBBANA

movement, through the levels of consciousness, to karmic momentum and that the fourth P. Arūpa Jhāna is the stage of transition to consciousness without seed. As consciousness becomes increasingly purified '... the complete removal of one (arūpa) stage constitutes the attainment of the next.'²²

The first formless attainment is when the meditator abandons form as his object of concentration and practices space concentration²³ to realize the sphere of space-infinity (P. akasayatana). Even so, he '... sees that his attainment is shadowed by the rupa-Jhāna (and) wishes to attain the state of infinite consciousness, considering it to be even more tranquil.'²⁴ By continuing this practice, he passes beyond the sphere of infinite space and enters the sphere of infinite consciousness: the second formless attainment (P. viññānānañcāyatana).

This, also, is seen as an imperfection so '... the consciousness lets go of every concept... and enters a sphere where no-thing at all exists, not even the perception of nothingness (P. ākiñcaññāyatana) Self-consciousness is eliminated and '... the knower and known are merged in unity.'²⁵

Yet, the bliss of its tranquility is felt as subtle perception and this can only be neutralized by entering the sphere of neither-perception nor non-perception (P. nevasaññānasaññāyatana). Thus, '... the limit of all karmic action is reached;'²⁶ the yogin is at the final and transitional stage to the attainment of Nirvāna '... which is the total suspension of mind, mental properties, and the mental qualities associated with mind.'²⁷

There is similarity between Yogic and Buddhist techniques of attaining samādhi but in each case the emancipation is thought to be different. While admitting that yogins and non-Buddhist ascetics could have access to the eight transic states (P. jhānas), the Buddhists denied the authenticity of any claim by non-Buddhists to the attainment of the ninth state which is the release of Nirvāna: the destruction of consciousness and sensation which was specifically a discovery of the Buddha.²⁸ Whilst Buddhists (and others) would argue that Kaivalya and Nirvāna are completely different, the argument is perhaps not so clear cut. There is a striking correspondence between Kaivalya and Nirvāna in that both are thought of as pure, free

of defilements, uncompounded, infinite, and eternal. Both are profoundly concerned with unconditioned consciousness. Furthermore, some doubt exists as to what is implied by the 'destruction' of consciousness; i.e., when consciousness 'stops' or 'ceases' on the attainment of Nirvāna.

It is not said to be annihilated. It no longer transmigrates.²⁹ What happens to it? Perhaps this is the essential difference between Kaivalya and Nirvāna: the fact that Buddhism makes no positive statement about the final state of the released. Buddhist doctrine declares: 'In the dead man, not only are the three formations (verbal, bodily and thought formations) stilled but vitality is cut off, heat is cut off, the faculties are cut off. In a man who has entered the attainment of the dissolution of perception and sensation, although the (three) formations are stilled, vitality, heat and the faculties are not cut off. This is the difference.'³⁰ It could be that this difference applies equally to the achiever of Kaivalya and that Nirvāna equates with the nirbija state of Kaivalya.

In conclusion, I note that both Hindu and Buddhist yogins, after a period of moral and physical discipline, developed proficiency at attaining a degree of enstasy with the object of their concentration and, by the gradual removal of hindrances to consciousness, managed to intensify the degree of enstasis; eventually, object-orientated enstasy was transcended and a degree of formless attainment/subject-orientated enstasy ensued. This however, was still liable to subtle partiality but was eventually surpassed to attain liberation and '... the knowledge of the ultimate reality of all objects, material and phenomenal.'³¹

References

¹ Isherwood & Prabhavananda, How to Know God: The Yoga Aphorisms of Patanjali, (N.Y.: New American Library 1969), p.11.

² Ibid., p.122.

³ Mircea Eliade, From Primitives to Zen, (London: Collins, 1967), p.500.

⁴Georg Feuerstein, Textbook of Yoga, (London: Rider, 1975), p.130.

⁵Ian Kesacodi-Watson, Samādhi in Patañjali's Yoga-Sūtras, (Australia: an unpublished manuscript, 1980), p.13.

⁶Ibid., p.15.

⁷Mircea Eliade, Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, (N.Y.: Pantheon Books, 1958), p.83, quoting Viññānabhiksu's Yogasāra-samgraha.

⁸Ibid., pp.81-83.

⁹Ibid., p.83.

¹⁰Ibid., p.84, quoting Viññānabhiksu's Yogasāra-samgraha.

¹¹Ibid., p.84.

¹²Feuerstein, op.cit., p.132.

¹³Eliade, Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, op.cit., pp.93-95.

¹⁴Ibid., p.170.

¹⁵Mahathera Vajirananda, Buddhist Meditation in Theory and Practice, (Colombo: Gunasena, 1962), p.332,

Robert M. Gimello, 'Mysticism and Meditation', in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis, (ed.) S. Katz, (London: Sheldon Press, 1978), p.182, abstracted from Samaññaphala and Potthapāda Suttas of the Pāli Dīgha Nikāya.

¹⁶Christmas Humphries, Concentration and Meditation (London: Watkins, 1973), p.180.

¹⁷Edward Conze, Buddhist Meditation, (London: George Allan & Unwin, 1956), p.117.

¹⁸Humphries, op.cit., p.180, quoting Bhikkhu Silacara.

¹⁹Feuerstein, op.cit., p.58.

²⁰Mahathera Vajirananda, op.cit., pp.272-279.

²¹Humphries, op.cit., pp.183-184.

²²Mahathera Vajirananda, op.cit., p.332.

²³Upatissa, Vimuttimagga, (The Path of Freedom) (Colombo: Dr. Weerasuria, 1961), p.113.

²⁴Mahathera Vajirananda, op.cit., p.459.

²⁵Humphries, op.cit., p.182.

²⁶Ibid., p.183.

²⁷Mahathera Vajirananda, op.cit., p.465.

²⁸Eliade, Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, op.cit., pp.173-174.

²⁹Edward J. Thomas, The History of Buddhist Thought, (N.Y.: Barnes and Noble, 1971, 1st. publ., 1933), p.132.

³⁰Upatissa, op.cit., p.325.

³¹Lama Thubten Zopa, The Wish Fulfilling Golden Sun of the Mahayana Thought Training, (an unpublished manuscript), p.121.

Bibliography

Buddaghosa

Visuddhimagga (The Path of Purity) (tr.) Pe Maung Tin London: Luzac, 1971.

- Chang, Garma C.C. The Practice of Zen. U.S.: Perennial Library, 1970.
- Conze, Edward Buddhist Meditation. London: George Allan & Unwin, 1956.
- Eliade, Mircea From Primitives to Zen. London: Collins, 1967. Fount. 1977.
- Eliade, Mircea Yoga: Immortality & Freedom. N.Y.: Pantheon Books, 1958.
- Feuerstein, Georg The Essence of Yoga. London: Rider, 1974.
- Feuerstein, Georg Textbook of Yoga. London: Rider, 1975.
- Gimello, Robert M. 'Mysticism and Meditation,' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis. (ed.) S.Katz. London: Sheldon Press, 1978.
- Govinda, Lama Anagarika Creative Meditation and Multi-Dimensional Consciousness. G.B.: Mandala, 1977.
- Günther, H.V. and Kawamura, L.S. 'Development of Quiescence (Samatha).' in Mind in Buddhist Psychology. Emeryville: Ia: Dharma Pub., 1975.
- Happold, F.C. Prayer and Meditation. U.K.: Penguin, 1971.
- Humphries, Christmas Concentration and Meditation. London: Watkins, 1973.
- Isherwood, C. and Prabhavananda, Swami (trs.) How to Know God: the Yoga Aphorisms of Patanjali. N.Y.: New American Library, 1969.
- Isherwood, C. and Prabhavananda, Swami (trs.) Shankara's Crest jewel of Discrimination. Viveka-chudamani. Ca:Vedanta Press, 1978, 3rd ed., 1st publ., 1947.
- Johansson, Rune E. The Psychology of Nirvana: London: George Allan & Unwin, 1969.
- Kiyota, Minoru (ed.) Mahāyāna Buddhist Meditation: Theory and Practice. Honolulu: Univ. Press of Hawaii, 1978.
- Lama Thubten Zopa The Wish Fulfilling Golden Sun of the Mahayana Thought Train-
- Lu K'uan Yü The Secrets of Chinese Meditation. N.Y. Weiser, 1972.
- Mahadevan, T.M.P. Outlines of Hinduism. Bombay: Chetana, 1961.
- Mouni Sadhu Samadhi. London: George Allan Unwin, 1976.
- Nyanaponika Thera The Heart of Buddhist Meditation. London: Rider, 1972.
- Staal, Frits Exploring Mysticism. G.B.: Penguin, 1975.
- Swami Narayananda Secrets of Mind Control. India: N.K. Prasad, 1959, 2nd ed.
- Swami Narayananda A Practical Guide to Samadhi. India: N.K. Prasad, 1957.
- Swami Vivekananda Raja Yoga (or Conquering the Internal Nature). Calcutta: Advaita Ashrama, 1976.
- Swearer, Donald, K. Secrets of the Lotus. N.Y.: Macmillan, 1971.
- Tenzin Gyatso
the 14th Dalai Lama The Buddhism of Tibet and the Key to the Middle Way. London: George Allan & Unwin, 1975.
- Edward J. Thomas The History of Buddhist Thought, N.Y.: Barnes & Noble, 1971, 1st publ., 1933.
- Thubten Kalsang Rinpoche & Bhikku Pasadika Excerpts from the Surangama Samadhi Sutra. Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives.
- Upathissa Vimuttimagga. (The Path of Freedom). Colombo: Dr. Weerasuria, 1961.
- Vajirananda, Mahathera Buddhist Meditation in Theory and Practice. Colombo: Gunesana, 1962.

* * * *